

Draft Terms of Reference

Hiring of consulting services [Firm] for carrying out Third Party ‘Independent Verification’ of Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Project Achievements under Skills Strengthening for Industrial Value Enhancement (STRIVE)

1. Background:

The Government of India (GoI) introduced its National Policy for Skill Development and Entrepreneurship in 2015. A policy implementation framework is provided by the National Skill Development Mission (NSDM). The mission reflects the Government’s commitment to skilling opportunities for economically disadvantaged/underserved communities and developing a globally competitive workforce. The mission also seeks to shift towards outcome-focused training provision and establishes and enforces cross-sectoral, nationally and internationally acceptable standards for skill training by creating a sound quality assurance framework.

Skills Strengthening for Industrial Value Enhancement (STRIVE) is a national program by the Ministry of Skills Development and Entrepreneurship (MSDE). The program is scheduled to run for approximately five years till November 2022.

STRIVE is a World Bank assisted Government of India program with the objective of improving the relevance and efficiency of skills training provided through ITIs and apprenticeships. STRIVE is implemented by the Ministry of Skill Development & Entrepreneurship (MSDE) through State Governments, Industrial Training Institutes (ITIs), Centrally Funded Institutes (CFIs) and Industry Clusters (ICs). It also supports two sub-missions of the National Skill Development Mission (NSDM). The program consists of a Program for Results (PforR) component that is comprised of four results areas as listed below:

Results Area 1: Improved Performance of Industrial Training Institutes

Results Area 2: Increased Capacities of State Governments to Support Industrial Training Institutes and Apprenticeship Training

Results Area 3: Improved Teaching and Learning

Results Area 4: Improved and Broadened Apprenticeship Training

STRIVE is a Central Sector Scheme (CSS) with total budget provision of about INR. 2,200 Crores.

The outputs under the STRIVE will be monitored annually through the Results Framework (RF) and are therefore aligned with the Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI) matrix of STRIVE. Overall program monitoring at the national level, is the responsibility of the National Project Implementation Unit (NPIU), Directorate General of Training (DGT), Ministry of Skill Development & Entrepreneurship (MSDE). The NPIU will also monitor the progress and process of the program at the State level.

The Monitoring of the ITIs in the states will be vested with State Project Implementation Units (SPIUs). State Apprenticeship Monitoring Cells (SAMCs), housed within SPIUs, will facilitate the selection of ICs and further monitoring of progress of performance of selected ICs in the state. Annexure I indicates the number of probable States and Union Territories where the STRIVE program would be implemented, and, Annexure II indicates probable list of State and Union Territories where the STRIVE program will be implemented. The list of selected ITIs, after completion of Performance Based [PB] Grant agreement process will be provided to the consultant firm (selected as Independent Verification Agency) in due course. In addition to this, State wise final list of Industrial Clusters (ICs) will be also be provided.

2. Objective:

The objective of this assignment is to engage an Independent Verification Agency (“IVA” called as “Consultant”) to verify the performance of the program on Program for Result (PforR), Disbursement Linked Indicators [DLIs] and project achievements. This task needs to be carried out by the consultant in each year of its engagement.

The selected consultant is expected to engage with various listed stakeholders but not limited to: State Governments, State Project Implementation Unit (SPIU), Industrial Training Institutes (ITIs), Centrally funded Institutes (CFIs) including National Instructional Media Institute (NIMI) and Central Staff Training and Research Institute (CSTARI), Regional Directorates for

Apprenticeship Training (RDATs), Industry clusters (ICs)/ Industry Apprenticeship Initiatives (IAIs) and State Apprenticeship Monitoring Cells (SAMC), under the overall direction of National Project Implementation Unit (NPIU) to ensure verification of specific outputs in agreed areas.

For the verification of results, the Consultant will be expected to carry out the assignment with detailed outline of methodology, sample design, data collection protocol, data collection tools which will be intended to verify the achievement of specific targets aligned with the DLIs.

The information collected under the aegis of DGT by the IVA will serve as the data source for assessing progress towards the DLIs.

3. Scope of Services:

The Independent Verification Agency (IVA) selected to carry out this assignment will be engaged for a period of 3 years and the assignment may be extended until program completion period based on satisfactory performance on an annual basis and progress of the scheme.

The specific scope of Services would include:

- a) Carrying out an independent verification of achievement of the DLIs reported by DGT for each disbursement claim under the Program, based on the Verification Protocol agreed between MSDE and the World Bank; and
- b) Preparing and submitting independent and comprehensive verification reports to DGT with a copy to the World Bank for DLI achievement reports for each disbursement claim prepared by DGT in the form and substance acceptable to DGT and the World Bank.

The IVA will verify the DLIs as per the agreed terms, through desk, paper and physical inspection to confirm the accuracy and quality of results and eligible disbursement amounts claimed by the DGT in its supporting documentation with each disbursement claim. In accordance with good audit practice, verification will take place against a sampling framework and frequency, described in detail in the Verification Protocol as given below at point 3.1.2.

The Program has **six** specific DLIs as follows:

- DLI-1:** Increase in the number of graduates from ITIs that have signed Performance-Based (PB) Grant Agreements.
- DLI-2:** Improvement in industrial training and employment outcomes for trainees and graduates of ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements.
- DLI-3:** Reduction in ITIs' trainer vacancies and improvements in training of trainers.
- DLI-4:** Number of Participating States that have conducted tracer studies.
- DLI-5:** Number of Industry Clusters (ICs) that have introduced at least 2 different apprenticeship programs within their participating (member) industries.
- DLI-6:** Increase in female enrolment rate in ITIs with PB Grant Agreements and ICs receiving Industry Apprenticeship Initiative (IAI) Grants.

The report of the IVA will cover the verification of various DLIs across all the above mentioned four result areas of STRIVE. Additionally, for determining the sample size, the minimum Confidence Level of 95% and P –Value of 5% and/or Sample Error $\pm 5\%$ need to be followed.

For DLIs 1, 2 and 6, the IVA will validate the data on the number of graduates, number of trainees undergoing On-the-Job Training (OJT), employment outcomes of ITI graduates and female enrollment in all the ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements.

For DLIs 3 and 4, the IVA will verify the data submitted by the states on the reduction in vacancies of trainers and tracer studies conducted by the states that are participating in STRIVE.

Further, for DLI 3, the IVA will also verify the roll-out of blended mode of learning under Craft Instructors Training Scheme (CITS) trades in National Skill Training Institute (NSTI) formerly known as Advanced Training Institute (ATIs) on a sample basis.

For DLIs 5 and 6, the IVA will verify all the data available with State Directorate/Regional Directorate of Apprenticeship Training (RDATs) on the number of participating ICs and female enrollment in apprenticeship programs run by these ICs.

The IVA will develop a detailed verification protocol that builds on the verification protocol contained in the Program Appraisal Document [PAD]¹ for collecting and processing of data required for assessment and validation of key performance data against achievements of DLIs.

3.1 Approach and Methodology:

3.1.1 Approach:

The IVA needs to conduct study and prepare a report on the findings related to the achievement of physical targets. The IVA will also verify the financial utilization progress and process with respect to achievement of the physical targets outlined on the program.

In this connection, the IVA has to prepare and submit detailed methodology for data collection which includes, *inter alia*, sample design, sample size, data collection, reach out plan and data analysis procedure, with focus on the activities pertaining to the Disbursement Linked Result [DLR] and DLIs of STRIVE.

While preparing such a methodology; the IVA has to justify rationale behind choosing the sample ensuring adequate representation of the States/SPIUs, ITIs and ICs. These documents including templates need to be shared with DGT and World Bank team for their review and due approval has to be obtained from DGT. The IVA should ensure that data and information collected for the process can be used for further reliability and verification checks.

3.1.2 Methodology:

The IVA, in order to verify the DLRs and DLIs on progress and process, needs to consider a representative sample taking into consideration all the participating States/SPIUs, Union Territories and program implementing units covered under STRIVE. The indicative universe for the purpose of verification comprises of 36 States & UTs (SPIUs including SAMCs), two Central Field Institutes, 500 ITIs (400 Government and 100 Private), and 100 ICs (Annex-I and II).

¹ <http://projects.worldbank.org/P156867/?lang=en&tab=documents&subTab=projectDocuments>

In this process, all the program implementation units have to be covered at least once in a phased manner during the assignment period of three years. It is thus envisaged that one-third of the total program implementation units might be covered in each year of contract. Whilst following this process, appropriate distribution and representation of all the program implementation units mentioned have to be ensured by the IVA.

In this connection, the IVA needs to select the States and UTs/SPIUs, SAMCs, ITIs and ICs for each cycle by adopting appropriate statistical significance sample size determination method. In order to determine the sample size, the minimum Confidence Level of 95% and P –Value of 5% and/or Sample Error $\pm 5\%$ needs to be followed.

The IVA needs to develop a scientific verification protocol to ensure data quality assurance pertaining to the DLR under each disbursement claim satisfying the DLIs outlined for the purpose. Prior to implementation, approval on the same need to be sought from the DGT and the World Bank.

The purpose of such physical verification of progress and achievements by NPIU, SPIU, ITIs and ICs is to validate operational performance parameters outlined under the program through field inspections and surveys, as required. The verification of the financial performance will also be carried out by the IVA on the line of activities outlined to achieve the DLIs.

Inspection and verification (on-site) of the data and support document/evidence provided by the NPIU, SPIUs, ITIs and ICs will also be taken up by the IVA. Interviews and discussions with the trainees, trainers, personnel associated in implementation of the program and other stakeholders, where necessary might be undertaken on a sample basis.

The IVA needs to carry out any other relevant activities as assigned and relevant for verification under STRIVE.

- (i) **The basis for the verification by the IVA would include, but would not be limited to the following:**
- a. The DLI Verification Protocol agreed between MSDE and the World Bank and the verification plan that will be prepared by IVA for each DLI for each disbursement claim as per Annexure III.
 - b. The project manuals and implementation plan provided by DGT
 - c. Project monitoring reports.
 - d. Any contracts entered between any of the project implementing entities and third parties.
 - e. Physical on-site verification, interviews and discussions with beneficiaries and other stakeholders.
 - f. Other relevant documents provided by DGT from time to time.
- (ii) **The methods and tools used in the assessment may include a combination of the following:**
- a. Literature Review: The IVA needs to review documents and literature available and relevant to accomplish the verification objectives. These documents may be the PAD document of World Bank, Manuals and any other related documents/reports/literatures.
 - b. Key Informant Interviews (KIIs): KIIs are suggested to be conducted with key stakeholders, including Ministry of Skill Development & Entrepreneurship (MSDE), National Project Implementation Unit (NPIU) of Directorate General of Training (DGT), State Project Implementation Unit (SPIU) World Bank, ITIs, state societies, employers, industry representatives associated with particular ITI, trainees), Industry clusters (ICs) and State Apprenticeship Monitoring Cells (SAMC). While doing so, the IVA should have adequate representation of all the stakeholders, including those of the ITIs who have signed PB Grant Agreement, and ICs.
 - c. Validation of project MIS reports: ITIs, ICs, SPIUs and SAMCs along with other stakeholders will report project performance through NCVT and NSDC

apprenticeship MIS portal. The responsibility of the IVA is to verify and validate the reported data on sufficiently large and statistically significant sample method.

- d. The IVA will collect quantitative data and information from the ITIs, States and ICs for verification purpose. Likewise, the qualitative data and information such as photographs, videos, case studies, success stories etc., uploaded in the MIS portal will also be validated by the IVA. The results of the qualitative studies may be triangulated with the quantitative findings to draw conclusions relating efficiency, effectiveness, constraints and risks related to the various DLIs, DLRs of the STRIVE

3.2 DLI wise description of deliverables

DLI wise description is shared as Annexure III and Annexure IV.

Scalability of various DLIs is as follows:

DLI No	DLI Description	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)
1	Increase in the number of graduates from ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Year 1: Yes • Year 2 onward: No
2	Improvement in industrial training and employment outcomes for trainees and graduates for ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements	No
3	Reduction in ITIs' trainer vacancies and improvements in training of trainers (i) Number of participating states who have reduced the vacancies of sanctioned trainer posts by at least 20% in government ITIs compared with vacancies in academic year 2017-18 (ii) Upgradation and roll out of four CITS trades	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (i) Yes • (ii) Yes

DLI No	DLI Description	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)
4	Number of Participating States that have conducted tracer studies	Yes
5	Number of ICs that have introduced at least 2 different apprenticeship programs within their participating (member) industries	Yes
6	Increase in female enrollment rate in ITIs with PB Grant Agreements and ICs receiving IAI Grants (i) Increase in female enrolment across ITIs with signed PBGAs (ii)Female enrolment in ICs receiving IAI grants	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (i) No • (ii)Yes

DLIs will be verified by the IVA and verification report submitted to DGT with a copy to the World Bank along with supporting documentation to enable it to report the achieved results to the World Bank. The verification report format might be revised, if required, based on the outcomes of the first-year verification process and reporting.

DLI Verification Protocol table is shared as Annexure IV

4. Team Composition, Minimum Qualification Requirements for the Key Experts (and any other desirable requirements which will be used for evaluating the Key Experts)

DGT will assess the demonstrated experience and capacity of interested consulting firms applying for this assignment for credible verification. The assignment requires a firm with experience in results-based programs financed by the government and/or externally aided projects in skills and other allied sector, including but not limited to apprenticeship programs, on-the job training programs and distant learning, use of IT/ICT in supporting similar programs, program management, procurement and financial management, and experts in fiduciary, social, environment and other scheme operational performance aspects.

The IVA will be expected to deploy sufficient amount of manpower required to successfully deliver the tasks to ensure credible verification. An indicative manpower requirement for the assignment duration must include Key Experts of suitable qualifications and experience for the key positions as tabulated below.

Table 1 Minimum Qualification and Indicative Experience of Key Experts

S.no.	Key Position	Nos.	Minimum Qualification and Indicative Professional Experience Desired	Indicative Estimated Man Months
K1	Team Leader <i>Represent IVA in meetings at national Level. Plan, supervise and manage the coordination of entire assignment</i>	1	Masters in Economics or Statistics (or a similar qualification) from a reputed University. Professional with experience of at least 15 years, and with strong background in project management, independent verification, data collection, data analysis, monitoring, and evaluation. Exceptional leadership skills to manage diverse stakeholders related to managing and imparting training in skill eco system and lead clients. Experience of working on externally aided projects preferred. S/he should have about 10 years of demonstrated experience in assessment and/or evaluation of development sectors programs (preferably vocational education) (required).	Equivalent to 3 person months per year

S.no.	Key Position	Nos.	Minimum Qualification and Indicative Professional Experience Desired	Indicative Estimated Man Months
			The incumbent should have experience in managing projects involving quantitative data collection, questionnaire design and large-scale surveys with a large geographic spread. Exposure to randomized control trials, propensity score matching, regression, and design effects is preferred.	
K2	Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Specialist <i>Assist in designing the template for information from stakeholders required for assignment and further evaluate the program outcomes</i>	1	Masters in Business Administration with engineering background from a reputed University, and more than 10 years of relevant experience in labor market issues and M&E. The expert should have the experience of designing and conducting rigorous surveys of development technical and vocational education and training (TVET) projects. Experience in conducting tracer studies and impact evaluation of large scale national / state level projects of Govt. of India or State Govt. 7 years of experience in monitoring and evaluation of development programs in areas of vocational education/skill development managed	Equivalent to 3 person months per year

S.no.	Key Position	Nos.	Minimum Qualification and Indicative Professional Experience Desired	Indicative Estimated Man Months
			and imparted by large public/private establishments. Proficiency in using statistical analysis software, such as STATA, SPSS, and MS Excel. Qualitative data analysis software (such as QSR) will be added advantage.	
K3	Apprenticeship Expert <i>Assist team in verification of apprenticeship related DLIs</i>	1	Post-Graduation or equivalent with at least 08 years' experience of working with organizations dealing with Apprenticeship Training & hiring of apprentices. Knowledge of apprenticeship system in India including apprenticeship Act. 1961 and further amendments. Experience of working with industry/industry associations/ industry clusters	Equivalent to 3 person months during 3 years
K4	Curriculum Expert <i>Assist team in verification of curricula specific DLIs</i>	1	Post-graduation or equivalent with at least 8 years of experience of developing curricula for vocational training in different sectors	Equivalent to 3 person months during 3 years
K5	Institutional Development Expert <i>Assist team in verification of professional</i>	1	Bachelor's degree in engineering with at least 8 years of experience of working on national level / state level projects in the skill development /	Equivalent to 3 person months during 3 years

S.no.	Key Position	Nos.	Minimum Qualification and Indicative Professional Experience Desired	Indicative Estimated Man Months
	<i>development specific DLIs</i>		vocational education sector with the Government and private sector	
K6	IT Specialist <i>Plan and supervise consolidation, concurrent validation, processing and analysis of data</i>	1	B.E./B. Tech./MCA with 6-10 years of experience in MIS development and management especially in large-scale monitoring and evaluation projects.	Equivalent to 3 person months per year
K7	Statistician <i>Assist the team in determination of sample size, sample design, design of study tools, data analysis using STATA, SPSS and other statistical software.</i>	1	Master's degree in Statistics from reputed University having at least 5 years of relevant experience in designing and conducting evaluation studies, tracer studies, large scale surveys and doing empirical research are required.	Equivalent to 2 person months per year
K8	Report Writer <i>Producing professionally edited and formatted reports in form and substance acceptable to MSDE and World Bank</i>	1	Master's degree in English, Journalism, or Mass Communication from a reputed University with more than 5 years of relevant work experience in report writing. S/he will edit drafts of reports prepared by the IVA.	Equivalent to 2 person months per year

S.no.	Key Position	Nos.	Minimum Qualification and Indicative Professional Experience Desired	Indicative Estimated Man Months
K9	Central Field Co-ordinator <i>Assist the team in planning field visits and co-ordinating with field surveyors to ensure timely completion of assignment</i>	1	Master's degree in Social Work, Rural Management, Economics, or other relevant discipline from reputed University. H/she should have more than 6 years' experience of working as a field coordinator in any Independent Verification Agency (IVA). Should have experience of conducting and supervising surveys, studies of similar nature. S/he should have experience in supervising data collection, analysis and man management. Should be fluent in English and Hindi with excellent English writing, spoken and presentation skills.	Equivalent to 3 person months per year

Table 2 Minimum Qualification and Indicative Experience of Non-Key Experts

Sl.No.	Position	Nos.	Minimum Qualification/Indicative Experience	Indicative Estimated Man Months
NK1	Field Surveyors <i>[i] Assist central field coordinator in planning out and conducting the surveys.</i>	5	(i) Preferably with a degree in Social Work, Rural Management, Economics, Engineering or other relevant discipline, and more than 3 years' experience of conducting surveys.	Equivalent to 3 person months per year for each position

<i>[ii] Assist in collecting required field data</i>		[ii] Prior knowledge of surveying and collecting data in skill eco system will be preferable.
--	--	---

While evaluating Technical proposals, CVs of the Key Experts proposed by the Consultant will be evaluated with respect to the indicative qualification and experience specified for each position in the above table 1.

5. Reporting Requirements and Time Schedule for Deliverables

a. The IVA shall carry out the assignment under the overall supervision of MSDE. However, day-to-day coordination of activities for the verification process shall be managed and coordinated by NPIU under MSDE.

b. The MSDE, DGT, NPIU and SPIU representatives shall provide the IVA with relevant data and documents necessary to verify DLI achievements and shall ensure that it has access to all project sites and locations.

c. The IVA shall submit the following reports to DGT, with a copy to the World Bank as per timelines stipulated below :

1. Develop and furnish to DGT and World Bank an **Inception report (for DLI verification)** in 2 Parts within one month of contract signature and prior to commencement of verification process.
 - (i) Part 1 will cover tech-enabled templates in which it seeks input data from DGT that is to be verified by the IVA.
 - (ii) Part 2 will contain its own verification plan for each DLI. Verification plan will include detailed work plan with staffing and verification arrangements proposed by IVA for each DLI that would be claimed by DGT for each disbursement claim for verification. This will also cover IVA’s team composition, names of sites and offices that would be visited, agreed days and dates for each visit, details of the field survey to be carried out by the IVA, coordination and logistics arrangements needed by IVA and output formats for

each site visit that will go in the IVA’s verification report. IVA will seek DGT approval of such verification plan included in the Inception Report.

2. Develop and furnish to DGT and World Bank **annual verification reports for DLIs** (single report covering all relevant DLIs for that particular year) in the form and substance acceptable to DGT and World Bank.
3. Submit an **‘assignment completion report’** containing summary of work done and suggestions for strengthening the verification protocol and process for future use by DGT and World Bank. The report shall be in the form and substance acceptable to DGT and World Bank.

d. **Deliverable and Deadlines**

Task Deliverables Number	Task Deliverables	Description	Deadline
1.	Inception report (inclusive of approved verification plan)	Refer para 5.c. 1 of ToR	T ₀ + 1month
2.	DLI Verification Report for Year-1	The IVA is required to carry out verification against each DLI claim as and when asked by MSDE. It is envisaged the number of such verification exercise will not exceed more than two times in a year with prior intimation of mutually agreed sufficient time period by DGT, MSDE.	Report to be prepared and submitted to DGT with a copy to the World Bank within 30 days of verification of all relevant DLIs each year.
3.	DLI Verification Report for Year-2		
4.	DLI Verification Report for Year-3		

Task Deliverables Number	Task Deliverables	Description	Deadline
		Each report would cover the verification of all 6 DLI verification for that particular year.	
5.	Assignment completion report	Refer para 5.c.3 of ToR	Within 45 days of T ₀ +3 years

6. Client’s Input and facilities to be made available to the consultant by the client:

- i. Give access to all the required documents, correspondence and any other information associated with the project and assignment, as felt necessary by DGT in discussion with IVA.
- ii. Provide administration support in coordination with States to facilitate timely implementation of the assignment

7. Composition of review committee to monitor consultants work

DGT will appoint a senior person during contract negotiation who will monitor and coordinate the study activities of the IVA. The designated person will closely follow up with IVA and provide necessary guidance during the assignment. The designated person would provide all the necessary support to IVA and ensure access to ITIs, ICs, enterprises and other stakeholders. This support includes provision of relevant information and documents, facilitation of contact to ITIs, enterprises and other stakeholders, and organization of meetings.

8. Reporting Progress:

The IVA needs to prepare a detailed action plan and submit progress report to DGT, with a copy to World Bank, on a regular basis at timelines mutually agreed with the DGT. The progress reports

should highlight the progress on assignment and various issues concerning efficient and timely execution of the assignment. In case of any deviation in the actual progress of the approved program, the IVA shall produce, at the request of DGT, a revised work plan and staff as required to ensure completion of the assignment within the stipulated time for completion.

9. Copyright

All materials and documentation during the assignment will be the sole property of DGT.

Annexure I

Number of States & UTs / SPIUs

	<u>Government</u>	<u>Private</u>	<u>Total</u>
States & UTs / SPIUs	36	-	36
SAMCs	36	-	36
ITI	400	100	500
IC	-	100	100

Annexure II

List of States and UTs under STRIVE

Sl. No	Name of States & UTs
1.	Andhra Pradesh
2.	Arunachal Pradesh
3.	Assam
4.	Bihar
5.	Chhattisgarh
6.	Delhi
7.	Goa
8.	Gujarat
9.	Haryana
10.	Himachal Pradesh
11.	Jammu and Kashmir
12.	Jharkhand
13.	Karnataka
14.	Kerala

Sl. No	Name of States & UTs
15.	Madhya Pradesh
16.	Maharashtra
17.	Manipur
18.	Meghalaya
19.	Mizoram
20.	Nagaland
21.	Orissa
22.	Punjab
23.	Rajasthan
24.	Sikkim
25.	Tamil Nadu
26.	Telengana
27.	Tripura
28.	Uttar Pradesh
29.	Uttarakhand
30.	West Bengal
31.	Andaman and Nicobar Islands
32.	Chandigarh
33.	Dadra and Nagar Haveli
34.	Daman and Diu
35.	Lakshadweep
36.	Puducherry

Annexure-III

Disbursement Linked Indicator Matrix

Disbursement Linked Indicators	DISBURSEMENT-LINKED RESULTS				
	Results to be achieved in Year 1	Results to be achieved in Year 2	Results to be achieved in Year 3	Results to be achieved in Year 4	Results to be achieved in Year 5
1. <i>Increase in the number of graduates from ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements</i>	At least 200 ITIs have signed PB Grant Agreements with MSDE*	The number of graduates in the academic year for ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements has increased by 5% compared with graduates in academic year 2015/16*	The number of graduates in the academic year for ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements has increased by 10% compared with graduates in academic year 2015/16*	The number of graduates in the academic year for ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements has increased by 15% compared with graduates in academic year 2015/16*	The number of graduates in the academic year for ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements has increased by 20% compared with graduates in academic year 2015/16*

Disbursement Linked Indicators	DISBURSEMENT-LINKED RESULTS				
	Results to be achieved in Year 1	Results to be achieved in Year 2	Results to be achieved in Year 3	Results to be achieved in Year 4	Results to be achieved in Year 5
2. <i>Improvement in industrial training and employment outcomes for trainees and graduates of ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements</i>		At least 5% of trainees enrolled in academic year 2018/19 across ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements have undergone OJT	At least 10% of trainees enrolled in academic year 2019/20 across ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements have undergone OJT	At least 15% of trainees enrolled in academic year 2020/21 across ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements have undergone OJT	At least 65% of trainees graduated in academic year 2019/20 from ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements are in gainful employment one year after graduation.

<p>3. <i>Reduction in ITIs’ trainer vacancies and improvements in training of trainers</i></p>	<p>MSDE has developed a sustainability plan for the recruitment, training and career progression for ITIs trainers*</p>	<p>At least 3 Participating States have reduced the vacancies of sanctioned trainers’ posts by at least 20% in government ITIs compared with vacancy numbers in academic year 2015/16*</p>	<p>(i) At least 5 Participating States have reduced the vacancies of sanctioned trainers’ posts by at least 20% in government ITIs compared with vacancy numbers in academic year 2015/16* and (ii) NIMI has upgraded at least 2 CITS trades and NCVT has rolled them out*</p>	<p>At least 7 Participating States have reduced the vacancies of sanctioned trainers’ posts by at least 20% in government ITIs compared with vacancy numbers in academic year 2015/16*</p>	<p>(i) At least 10 Participating States have reduced the vacancies of sanctioned trainers’ posts by at least 20% in government ITIs compared with vacancy numbers in academic year 2015/16*; and (ii) NIMI has upgraded at least 4 CITS trades and NCVT has rolled them out*</p>
---	---	--	---	--	---

Disbursement Linked Indicators	DISBURSEMENT-LINKED RESULTS				
	Results to be achieved in Year 1	Results to be achieved in Year 2	Results to be achieved in Year 3	Results to be achieved in Year 4	Results to be achieved in Year 5
4. <i>Number of Participating States that have conducted tracer studies</i>			At least 4 Participating States have conducted tracer studies and published their results*	At least 7 Participating States have conducted tracer studies and published their results*	At least 10 Participating States have conducted tracer studies and published their results*

Disbursement Linked Indicators	DISBURSEMENT-LINKED RESULTS				
	Results to be achieved in Year 1	Results to be achieved in Year 2	Results to be achieved in Year 3	Results to be achieved in Year 4	Results to be achieved in Year 5
5. <i>Number of ICs that have introduced at least 2 different apprenticeship programs within their participating (member) industries</i>	(i) MSDE has developed and approved/adopted the Operations Manual for the IAI Grant mechanism*; and (ii) At least 8 ICs, that have enrolled apprentices under the IAI Grant mechanism, have each introduced at least 2				

Disbursement Linked Indicators	DISBURSEMENT-LINKED RESULTS				
	Results to be achieved in Year 1	Results to be achieved in Year 2	Results to be achieved in Year 3	Results to be achieved in Year 4	Results to be achieved in Year 5
6. <i>Increase in female enrollment rate in ITIs with PB Grant Agreements and ICs receiving IAI Grants</i>		(i) Female enrollment across ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements during academic year 2018/19 has reached 11% of all enrollees; and (ii) A minimum of 5 ICs receiving IAI Grants have reached a female enrollment of 20% in their respective apprenticeship	Female enrollment across ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements during academic year 2019/20 has reached 12.5% of all enrollees	Female enrollment across ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements during academic year 2020/21 has reached 14% of all enrollees	Female enrollment across ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements during academic year 2021/22 has reached 15% of all enrollees

*These DLRs are not time-bound. The Fiscal Years in which they are expected to be achieved as per this Schedule are strictly for indicative purposes. These DLRs can accordingly be met up and until the Closing Date.

Annexure IV

DLI Verification Protocol Table

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
1	Increase in the number of graduates from ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements	<p>Year 1: Indicator measures the number of ITIs that have signed a PB Grant Agreement in accordance with the OM.</p> <p>Year 2 onward: Indicator measures the percentage increase over baseline of total number of graduates across all ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements.</p> <p>Graduates refer to trainees who have successfully completed a NSQF compliant CTS trade or any other NSQF compliant trade offered in the ITI with a minimum duration of 300 hours.</p> <p>The results for Year 2 through Year 5 may be achieved in any year.</p>	<p>Year 1: Yes</p> <p>Year 2 onward: No</p>	Annual progress report on STRIVE to be prepared by the MSDE	<p>ITIs will report through NCVT MIS portal each year. States will verify the report.</p> <p>Data will be validated on a sample basis by IVA.</p>

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
		For example, if MSDE achieves the result allocated for Year 4 in Year 3 itself, it will be entitled to receive the amount allocated for both Years 3 and 4 in Year 3 when it achieves the result.			
2	Improvement in industrial training and employment outcomes for trainees and graduates for ITIs that have signed	Year 2 to Year 4: Indicator measures the number of trainees undergoing OJT across all ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements in each academic year. This shall be counted for all dual training trades and other trades under CTS for which the curriculum has an OJT requirement. The minimum period of OJT	No	Year 2 to Year 4: Annual progress report on STRIVE to be prepared by the MSDE Year 5: Tracer	Year 2 to Year 4: ITIs will report through NCVT MIS portal each year. States will verify the report. Data will be validated on a sample basis by IVA. Year

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
	PB Grant Agreements	for the purpose of this indicator shall be as prescribed in the curricula for dual training trades and two weeks per year for other CTS trades. OJT requirement may be fulfilled through training in any enterprise, including informal and/or local industry, and production centres. Year 5: Graduates refer to trainees from ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements who successfully completed the CTS program in academic year 2019/20 and hold the National Trade Certificate. Indicator measures the percentage of all graduates who are wage employed, self-employed, or enrolled in an apprenticeship contract. Indicator will be measured by tracer studies. Measurement of the indicator is considered sufficient if tracer studies have captured 5% of the population of graduates. The study must (i) be based on		study conducted by MSDE	5: MSDE will conduct a tracer study on a sample basis for graduates from academic year 2019/20 from ITIs that have signed PB Grant Agreements.

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
		<p>a representative sample of students; (ii) have a sample size large enough to also include representation at the trade level; (iii) cover student background characteristics; and (iv) disaggregate data based on gender, caste, location rural/urban), education level, and household economic status.</p>			

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
3	Reduction in ITIs' trainer vacancies and improvements in training of trainers	<p>Participating states refer to those states that have signed PB Funding Agreement with the MSDE.</p> <p>Year 1: The indicator is met when the MSDE has developed guidelines for states to develop ITI teachers' development plans, which must include principles for recruitment, guidelines for training and further training, as well as guidelines for career progression and improvement of working conditions of technical teachers. In order to meet the DLI, at least 15 States must have developed specific teachers' development plans based on the guidelines provided by the MSDE.</p> <p>(i) Vacancy rate measures the share of posts filled either permanently or through contract teachers of the total sanctioned posts for</p>	<p>(i) Yes</p> <p>(ii) Yes</p>	<p>Year 1: Sustainability plan document (i) Annual progress report on STRIVE prepared by states (ii) Annual progress report on STRIVE to be prepared by the MSDE</p>	<p>Year 1: The DGT submits the document and proof of formal adoption to the World Bank task team leader.</p> <p>(i) States will submit data to the MSDE. Data will be validated on a sample basis by IVA. (ii) IVA verifies roll-out of upgraded CITS trades in ATIs on sample basis.</p>

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
		<p>NCVT trades in government ITIs. Relevant is the state average across all government ITIs in the state. Indicator is met if the vacancy rate is 20% lower than at baseline (2016/17). Each participating state that met the target is counted once.</p> <p>(ii) Indicator measures the number of CITS trades for which comprehensive new digital TL resource packages, incorporating effective use of video and computer-based multimedia as educationally appropriate, have been developed by NIMI, in consultation with CSTARI, using a curriculum revision and content development process, in order to offer the trades in a blended learning mode (comprising a combination of distance learning and face-to-face learning methods).</p>			

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
		There must also be evidence that the NCVT has offered the upgraded trade using these resource packages for enrolment in at least 2 ATIs.			

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
4	Number of Participating States that have conducted tracer studies	Participating states refer to those states that have signed PB Funding Agreement with the MSDE. Indicator measures the number of participating states that have completed tracer studies (sample surveys) of ITI graduates using a methodology accepted by the central government, which shall include that the study must (i) be based on a representative sample of students; (ii) have a sample size large enough to also include representation at the trade level; (iii) include both government and private ITIs; (iv) cover student background characteristics; and (v) disaggregate data based on gender, caste, location (rural/urban), education level, and household economic status. A tracer study is considered completed, if data has been submitted to the MSDE in a format accepted by the central	Yes	Tracer study reports by states; Annual progress reports for STRIVE prepared by the MSDE	Data will be validated on a sample basis by IVA.

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
		government and the findings are publicly disclosed.			
5	Number of ICs that have introduced at least 2 different apprenticeship programs within their participating (member) industries	<p>(i) Indicator is achieved when guidelines for the IAI grant mechanism are developed, approved and formally adopted by the MSDE and are agreeable to the World Bank. Guidelines are part of the STRIVE OM and include selection methods and criteria, eligible expenditure, disbursement rules and procedures, and a monitoring plan.</p> <p>(ii) Indicator refers to those ICs that have signed grant agreements with the MSDE under the IAI grant mechanism, and have introduced at least two different apprenticeship programs within their participating (member) industries. Apprenticeship programs must be designed in accordance with the requirements of upgraded dual training programs as defined</p>	Yes	<p>(i) Guideline document and STRIVE Operation Manual</p> <p>(ii) Enrollment lists; apprenticeship portal; annual progress report on STRIVE to be prepared by the MSDE</p>	<p>(i) The DGT submits the document and proof of formal adoption to the World Bank task team leader.</p> <p>(ii) RDATs to report on the number of ICs. Data will be validated on a sample basis by IVA.</p>

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
		<p>in the IAI guidelines of the OM. There must be evidence that at least 20 apprentices have been enrolled under each apprenticeship program. ICs that have introduced at least 2 such programs are counted only once.</p>			

DLI #	DLI Description	Definition/Description of Achievement	Scalability of Disbursements (Yes/No)	Data Source / Agency	Procedure
6	Increase in female enrollment rate in ITIs with PB Grant Agreements and ICs receiving IAI Grants	<p>(i) Indicator measures female enrollment across all ITIs with signed PB Grant Agreements for each academic year.</p> <p>(ii) Indicator measures the number of ICs that have signed grant agreements with the MSDE under the IAI grant mechanism that have at least 20% female enrollment in the apprenticeship programs introduced using the IAI grant funding. An IC which achieves the 20% female enrollment in any year is counted only once.</p>	<p>(i) No</p> <p>(ii) Yes</p>	<p>(i) Annual progress report on STRIVE to be prepared by the MSDE</p> <p>(ii) Enrollment lists; apprenticeship portal; annual progress report on STRIVE to be prepared by the MSDE</p>	<p>(i) ITIs will report through NCVT MIS portal each year. States will verify the report. Data will be validated on a sample basis by IVA.</p> <p>(ii) RDATs to report on the number of apprentices. Data will be validated by IVA on a sample basis</p>

*Since PB Grant Agreement ITIs have not yet been identified baseline information is based on the average across all ITIs.

